TO: Sabrina B. Landreth  
City Administrator  

FROM: Jeff Tumlin  
Interim Director, DOT  

SUBJECT: Parking and Mobility Initiatives  

DATE: January 3, 2016  

RECOMMENDATION  

Staff Recommends That the City Council Adopt a Resolution Authorizing the City Administrator or Designee to Negotiate, Finalize and Execute a Non-Exclusive Agreement with Streetline Inc. for a Smart Parking System at No Direct Cost to the City for a Term of Three Years  

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY  

Streetline Inc. is proposing to invest approximately one million dollars in infrastructure and nearly half a million in operating costs over a three-year period to bring its smart parking solution to as many as fifteen hundred city block faces. Staff is requesting authorization to enter into a non-exclusive agreement with Streetline and to support the pilot project by providing limited access to existing assets such as streetlights, traffic signal systems and open data sources including parking meter and garage occupancy data. The implementation of this pilot project will be closely aligned with and support the federally-funded Parking and Mobility Management Initiative.  

REASON FOR SUPPLEMENTAL  

On October 25, 2016, the Public Works Committee held the item concerning the Streetline Inc. proposal that was included in the Parking and Mobility Initiatives report, directing staff to (1) further specify the actual costs of the smart parking system to the City and (2) share the Streetline proposal with the City’s Privacy Advisory Commission before returning to Committee.  

(1) What are the actual costs associated with each of the City’s responsibilities in the proposed agreement with Streetline, Inc.?  

The following table lists the City’s responsibilities as detailed in the draft agreement, along with an explanation for how staff expects to meet these responsibilities, the fiscal impact and an estimation of Department of Transportation (DOT) staff time dedicated to doing so (see Table 1 below). The latter represents the actual cost to the City of entering into the proposal arrangement.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
<th>Fiscal Impact</th>
<th>Actual Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Securing all required permissions and permits granting installation permit to Streetline at no cost to Streetline</td>
<td>Staff will define and grant the necessary permissions as part of the final agreement; resources already dedicated to negotiating and managing professional service contracts are available</td>
<td>Minimal staff costs anticipated to facilitate permitting</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of four hours at project start</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arranging for street closures and applicable sign postings</td>
<td>Staff will define and arrange for street closures as part of the final agreement; necessary signage will be produced by the project manager using standard supplies (such as pre-printed cardstock and office printers)</td>
<td>Minimal staff costs anticipated to facilitate posting; no closures are anticipated</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of three hours during project implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arranging for continuous power for gateway(s) through an acceptable source (120 or 240v, 50 or 60 Hz) at a location (or locations) in accordance with Network Plan</td>
<td>Staff will define and permit Streetline to use power drawn from existing traffic signal infrastructure; 10 watts takes 100 hours to consume 1 Kilowatt hour; assuming $.13 per kilowatt hour, the cost of a single gateway would be about 1/10th of a penny per hour or about $.03 per day or $9 per year</td>
<td>Approximately $90.00 per year (assuming a network consisting of 10 gateway devices)</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of eight hours to oversee use of power by the Streetline system annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperating with Streetline in establishing metrics and providing necessary benchmark data for Streetline's Executive Summary report</td>
<td>OakDOT's Strategic Plan calls for efficient, data-driven decision making; staff are available to cooperate with Streetline in establishing and tracking metrics and benchmarks for the smart parking network</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of eight hours to help establish metrics and interpret data annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
<td>Fiscal Impact</td>
<td>Actual Costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using best efforts to notify Streetline 10 business days prior to scheduled road paving or slurring activity of areas with sensors</td>
<td>Staff can efficiently notify Streetline and other contractors of scheduled road paving and slurring activity via email</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of two hours to ensure Streetline is notified of work in the right-of-way annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promptly notifying Streetline of any power interruption to gateways or removal of repeaters or gateways by Customer’s maintenance crews</td>
<td>Staff can efficiently notify Streetline and other contractors of any interruption of power to gateways or removals of repeaters via email</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of one hour to ensure Streetline is notified of interruptions annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishing a plan for active marketing, advertising and promotion of the Smart Parking system and the Parker App with the goal of achieving 10,000 local downloads of the Parker App</td>
<td>Staff will develop a marketing plan for the Streetline smart parking system along with other parking and mobility manage initiatives; advertising and promotion can be accomplished using existing resources (e.g. digital displays on IPS smart meters, parking webpages, and electronic communications)</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of eight hours to help establish a plan for achieving desired number of downloads at project start.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To the extent available, providing anonymized data to Streetline</td>
<td>Provision of anonymized data will be automated after initial configuration by staff using available application program interfaces</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of eight hours to configure and source available data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To the extent available, providing machine readable policy information to Streetline</td>
<td>Staff will source or direct Streetline to machine readable policy information, including online resources such as Legistar, the Oakland Municipal Code and the City’s website</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of two hours to provide available policy information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility</td>
<td>Explanation</td>
<td>Fiscal Impact</td>
<td>Actual Costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To the extent available, providing real-time and historical payment information for parking</td>
<td>Provision of anonymized data will be automated after initial configuration using available application program interfaces</td>
<td>Minimal additional costs anticipated; this task can be folded into overall parking program</td>
<td>Estimated DOT staff time of eight hours to configure and source available data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Together, the City's one-time and recurring responsibilities under the agreement are estimated to require ninety (90) hours of staff time. Beyond this, staff estimates the three-year project will require an additional ninety (90) hours for project oversight, administration and reporting (as called for in the authorizing resolution). Using the hourly rate found in the Master Fee Schedule for Traffic Control Plan Review of $104, the total actual cost of the Streetline project is estimated to be $18,700.00 of existing staff time.

(2) What feedback has the Privacy Advisory Commission given concerning this item?

DOT staff presented the Streetline Inc. proposal at November 3, 2016 meeting of the Privacy Advisory Commission. At that meeting, the Commission requested that Streetline complete a detailed questionnaire and provide additional information before returning to the Commission's December 1, 2016 meeting for further consideration.

At the latter meeting, the Commission voted to provide its feedback to the Public Works Committee by endorsing a revised version of the authorizing resolution.

Major revisions include:

- Recognition that the Privacy Advisory Commission has been consulted and helped shape the authorizing resolution;
- Removal of any references to License Plate Recognition (LPR) or Automated License Plate Recognition (ALPR) technology;
- Resolve to have any such data provided by the City to Streetline be free of any identifying information;
- Resolve that any use of cameras by Streetline be accompanied by signage that explains their use and purpose to the public and that each installation be removed after a maximum of two weeks;
- Resolve that staff return to the Privacy Advisory Commission once a year for the three-year duration of the pilot program to present results and incorporate those results and the Commission's comments into an informational report for Council; and
- Resolve that the agreement between the City of Oakland and Streetline shall require Streetline to notify the City of Oakland and the Privacy Advisory Commission of material changes to its end user license agreements or privacy policies which change the scope of data gathered from individual users or the use of that data.
A record of the Commission’s review of the Streetline proposal, including complete documentation and video of proceedings, can be found on the Commission’s webpage: http://www2.oaklandnet.com/government/o/CityAdministration/d/PrivacyAdvisoryCommission/index.htm

ACTION REQUESTED OF THE CITY COUNCIL

Staff recommends that the City Council adopt a resolution authorizing the City Administrator or Designee to negotiate, finalize and execute a non-exclusive agreement with Streetline Inc. for a smart parking system at no direct cost to the City for a term of three years.

For questions regarding this report, please contact Michael Ford, Parking and Mobility Programs Manager, Safe Streets Division, at 510-238-7670.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeff Yumiko
Interim Director, Department of Transportation

Reviewed by:
Wladimir Wlassowsky, P.E., Interim Assistant Director
Bureau of Great Streets

Prepared by:
Michael Ford, Ph.D., C.P.P., Parking and Mobility Programs Manager
Safe Streets Division

Item:________________________
Public Works Committee
January 24, 2016
RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CITY ADMINISTRATOR OR DESIGNEE TO NEGOTIATE, FINALIZE AND EXECUTE A NON-EXCLUSIVE AGREEMENT WITH STREETLINE INC. FOR A SMART PARKING SYSTEM AT NO DIRECT COST TO THE CITY FOR A TERM OF THREE YEARS

WHEREAS, the Downtown Oakland Parking Management Report recommends that the City improve the management of City-owned parking supply by, among other things, improving parking monitoring and enforcement with integrated “smart” meters, off-street Parking Access and Revenue Control Systems; evaluating emerging parking occupancy sensor technologies (in-ground and/or on-meter) and consider deploying them if and when current reliability, accuracy and cost problems are overcome; and developing real-time wayfinding systems; and

WHEREAS, Streetline Inc. has developed a smart parking system that promises to deliver consumer facing parking applications and parking management information; and

WHEREAS, parking management systems are rapidly evolving: smart meters, vehicle detection systems, machine learning, smart phone applications, wireless networks and other components are converging to create increasingly sophisticated “smart parking” systems; and

WHEREAS, business models and public-private partnerships are evolving to support those systems; and

WHEREAS, Streetline Inc. is proposing to invest in the installation and operation of a smart parking system in Oakland in the amount of approximately one million dollars in infrastructure and nearly half a million in operating costs over a three-year period to bring its smart parking solution to as many as fifteen hundred city block faces, with no direct cost to the City; and

WHEREAS, Staff is requesting authorization to negotiate and enter into a non-exclusive agreement with Streetline that would commit the City to certain responsibilities like the following proposed by Streetline:

- Securing all required permissions and permits granting installation permission to Streetline at no cost to Streetline
- Arranging for street closures and applicable sign postings
- Arranging for continuous power for gateway(s) through an acceptable source (120 or 240v, 50 or 60 Hz) at a location (or locations) in accordance with Network Plan
- Cooperating with Streetline in establishing metrics and providing necessary benchmark data for Streetline’s Executive Summary report
- Using best efforts to notify Streetline 10 business days prior to scheduled road paving or slurring activity of areas with sensors
• Promptly notifying Streetline of any power interruption to gateways or removal of repeaters or gateways by Customer's maintenance crews
• Establishing a plan for active marketing, advertising and promotion of the Smart Parking system and the Parker App with the goal of achieving 10,000 local downloads of the Parker App
• To the extent available, providing machine readable policy information to Streetline
• To the extent available, providing real-time and historical payment information for parking; and

WHEREAS, Oakland Public Works and Information Technology staff have reviewed the Streetline proposal and assessed the technical merits and possible obstacles of the installation and operation of the system; and

WHEREAS, City staff agree that the design of the Streetline system has merit and that the technical obstacles to installing and operating the system are manageable; and

WHEREAS, in exchange and consideration for its installation and operation of the smart parking system, Streetline is proposing that it have the right to use the data that its system generates for its own commercial uses; and

WHEREAS, those uses and other aspects of Streetline's proposal have been reviewed by the City's Privacy Advisory Commission, which resulted in substantial changes to that proposal; and

WHEREAS, the implementation of this pilot project will be closely aligned with and support the MTC-funded Parking and Mobility Management Initiative; and

WHEREAS, Streetline Inc. has shared its proposal with Oakland community groups including Business Improvement Districts; and

WHEREAS, the City Council finds that the services provided pursuant to the agreement authorized hereunder are of a professional, scientific, or technical nature and are temporary in nature; and

WHEREAS, the City Council finds that this contract shall not result in the loss of employment or salary by any person having permanent status in the competitive service; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED: That the Council hereby authorizes the City Administrator or Designee to negotiate, finalize and execute an agreement with Streetline Inc. for a term of three years the installation, operation, maintenance and, if necessary, removal of its smart parking system at no direct cost to the City; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That said agreement may include permissions granted to Streetline, such as the temporary encumbrance and obstruction of the right-of-way, and obligate the City in ways that require no cash outlays to Streetline, such as providing data and supporting Streetline's marketing efforts; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That any such data provided by the City to Streetline be free of any identifying information; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That any use of cameras by Streetline be accompanied by signage that explains their use and purpose to the public and that each installation be removed after a
maximum of two weeks; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED**: That staff return to the Privacy Advisory Commission once a year for the three-year duration of the pilot program to present results and incorporate those results and the Commission’s comments into an informational report for Council; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED**: That said agreement between the City of Oakland and Streetline shall require Streetline to notify the City of Oakland and the Privacy Advisory Commission of material changes to its end user license agreements or privacy policies which change the scope of data gathered from individual users or the use of that data; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED**: That the City Attorney shall review and approve the proposed contract as to form and legality, and copies of the agreement(s) shall be filed with the Office of the City Clerk without returning to Council.

IN COUNCIL, OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA, _________________

PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES - BROOKS, CAMPBELL WASHINGTON, GALLO, GUILLEN, KALB, KAPLAN, REID and PRESIDENT GIBSON MCELHANEY

NOES -

ABSENT -

ABSTENTION -

ATTEST: ____________________________
LaTonda Simmons
City Clerk and Clerk of the Council
of the City of Oakland, California