New York University Journal of Law & Liberty
New York University School of Law
110 West Third Street
New York, NY, 10012-2411
Tel: (212) 992-8940 · Fax: (212) 995-4032
http://wwwnyujll.org

cite as: NYU J.L. & LIBERTY

<u>Submissions</u>—The *NYU Journal of Law & Liberty* gladly accepts unsolicited manuscripts. We publish well-written articles and essays of any length. Please footnote only when a citation is *necessary* or *helpful* and use the standard Bluebook format. The Journal prefers *electronic* submissions in *Word format*, emailed to:

law.jll.submissions@nyu.edu

Hard-copy submissions can be sent to: Submissions NYU Journal of Law & Liberty NYU School of Law 110 West Third Street New York, NY 10012-2411

**Subscriptions** – For domestic addresses, subscriptions are \$30 per year (\$28 for agents) or \$10 per issue. Foreign subscriptions are \$36 per year (\$34 for agents). Postage is included. Subscription requests should be sent **with payment** (check made payable to "New York University") to:

Journal Subscriptions NYU Journal of Law & Liberty NYU School of Law 110 West Third Street New York, NY 10012-2411

For further inquiries, contact us at law.jll.info@nyu.edu. Cover photograph by [info].

The NYU Journal of Law & Liberty is a quarterly publication devoted to the critical discussion of classical liberal legal scholarship. The Journal publishes essays and articles on the nature of rules & order, legal philosophy, theories of rights & liberty, constitutional law, jurisprudence, legal history, and historical & contemporary legislation.



### New York University Journal of Law & Liberty

### Masthead (2005-2006)

### <u>Editor-in-Chief</u> Robert J. McNamara

### <u>Managing Editor</u> Laura R. Pomeroy-Gerber

<u>Executive Articles Editor</u>

Jonathan Toren

<u>Executive Notes Editor</u>

Emily F. Schleicher

Assistant Managing Editor Notes Editors

Jacob Kreutzer Joseph Hammond

Jacob Kreutzer Benjamin Miles Joshua Pohl Sue Silverman

Articles EditorsJoshua PohlChris MoonSue SilvermanJoshua BlissZeke Vermilion

### **Staff Editors**

Amitai Barth ~ Jeffrey Benjamin ~ Amie Broder ~ Gavin Carrucan ~ Harold Davidson James Devlin Joshua Fulop ~ Bernard Goldsmith ~ Cameron Grant ~ Allison Grodin Matthew Gurch ~ Casey Hail ~ Jennifer Hardy ~ Matthew Jackson ~ Brendan Kileen John Naughton ~ Jordan Pace ~ Erik Patel ~ Christopher Rheinheimer ~ Desiree Ripo Evan Saucier ~ David Steinberg ~ Bryan Swiss ~ William Weeks Matthew Wolfe ~ David Yaroslavsky ~ Asaf Yeshaya

### Associate Editors

William Bunting ~ Timothy Forteau ~ Toby Freund ~ Chris Hemphill Kevin Lees ~ Eavon Rolich

### **Adjunct Editors**

Carina Cilluffo ~ Laura Dykes ~ Kurt Kastorf ~ Jennifer Wright

### Academic Advisors

Clayton Gillette ~ Geoffrey Miller ~ Mario Rizzo

## New York University Journal of Law & Liberty

Volume 1	2005	Number 2
Copyright © New York University Journal of Law & Liberty		
	~	
COLONIAL CRIMINAL	LAW AND PROCEDURE:	
THE ROYAL COLONY	of New Jersey 1749-57	
George C. Th	omas III	670
THE MINIMALIST PRIV	VILEGE	
Charles Hobs	боп	711
THE RISE AND FALL C	DF MATERIAL WITNESS	
DETENTION IN NINET	TEENTH CENTURY NEW YORK	
Wesley MacN	Neil Oliver	726
THE OTHER SULLIVAN	v Case	
Garret Epps		782
THE PROBLEM OF MO	DRAL DIRIGISME: A NEW	
ARGUMENT AGAINST	MORALISTIC LEGISLATION	
Mario J. Rizz	20	789
CANINE SNIFFS: THE	Search that Isn't	
Ken Lammers	S	844
THE "TRADITIONAL S	STATE FUNCTION" DOCTRINE:	
A COMPARATIVE INST	TITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE	
Christopher I	R. Edgar	856
No Such Thing: Lit	IGATING UNDER	
THE RATIONAL BASIS	Test	
Clark Neily		897

~

# ESSAY ON LIBERTY LIBERTARIANS IN BUSH'S WORLD Todd Seavey 914 BOOKS TARA ROSS ENLIGHTENED DEMOCRACY: THE CASE FOR THE ELECTORAL COLLEGE Review by Seth Barrett Tillman 921 BEAU BRESLAN THE COMMUNITARIAN CONSTITUTION

Review by Elizabeth Dale

930

# dedicated in fond memory of

Christopher R. Black 1975-2005

NYU Journal of Law & Liberty Articles Editor, gentleman, scholar, and friend.